

VZCZCXYZ0005
OO RUEHWEB

DE RUEHC #0500 1622133
ZNR UUUUU ZZH
O 112106Z JUN 09
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO AMEMBASSY BRASILIA IMMEDIATE 0000

UNCLAS STATE 060500

SIPDIS

E.O. 12958: N/A
TAGS: [KTIP](#) [ELAB](#) [KCRM](#) [KPAO](#) [KWMN](#) [PGOV](#) [PHUM](#) [PREL](#) [SMIG](#) [BR](#)
SUBJECT: BRAZIL -- 2009 TIP REPORT: PRESS GUIDANCE AND
DEMARCHE

REF: A. STATE 59732
[1](#)B. STATE 005577

[1](#)1. This is an action cable; see paras 5 through 7 and 10.

[1](#)2. On June 16, 2009, at 10:00 a.m. EDT, the Secretary will release the 2009 Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Report at a press conference in the Department's press briefing room. This release will receive substantial coverage in domestic and foreign news outlets. Until the time of the Secretary's June 16 press conference, any public release of the Report or country narratives contained therein is prohibited.

[1](#)3. The Department is hereby providing Post with advance press guidance to be used on June 16 or thereafter. Also provided is demarche language to be used in informing the Government of Brazil of its tier ranking and the TIP Report's imminent release. The text of the TIP Report country narrative is provided, both for use in informing the Government of Brazil and in any local media release by Post's public affairs section on June 16 or thereafter. Drawing on information provided below in paras 8 and 9, Post may provide the host government with the text of the TIP Report narrative no earlier than 1200 noon local time Monday June 15 for WHA, AF, EUR, and NEA countries and OOB local time Tuesday June 16 for SCA and EAP posts. Please note, however, that any public release of the Report's information should not/precede the Secretary's release at 10:00 am EDT on June 16.

[1](#)4. The entire TIP Report will be available on-line at www.state.gov/g/tip shortly after the Secretary's June 16 release. Hard copies of the Report will be pouched to posts in all countries appearing on the Report. The Secretary's statement at the June 16 press event, and the statement of and fielding of media questions by G/TIP's Director and Senior Advisor to the Secretary, Ambassador-at-Large Luis CdeBaca, will be available on the Department's website shortly after the June 16 event. Ambassador de Baca will also hold a general briefing for officials of foreign embassies in Washington DC on June 17 at 3:30 pm EDT.

[1](#)5. Action Request: No earlier than OOB local time Monday June 15 for WHA, AF, EUR, and NEA posts and OOB local time on Tuesday June 16 for SCA and EAP posts, please inform the appropriate official in the Government of Brazil of the June 16 release of the 2009 TIP Report, drawing on the points in para 9 (at Post's discretion) and including the text of the country narrative provided in para 8. For countries where the State Department has lowered the tier ranking, it is particularly important to advise governments prior to the Report being released in Washington on June 16.

[1](#)6. Action Request continued: Please note that, for those countries which will not receive an "action plan" with specific recommendations for improvement, posts should draw host governments' attention to the areas for improvement identified in the 2009 Report, especially highlighted in the "Recommendations" section of the second paragraph of the narrative text. This engagement is important to establishing the framework in which the government's performance will be

judged for the 2010 Report. If posts have questions about which governments will receive an action plan, or how they may follow up on the recommendations in the 2009 Report, please contact G/TIP and the appropriate regional bureau.

17. Action Request continued: On June 16, please be prepared to answer media inquiries on the Report's release using the press guidance provided in para 11. If Post wishes, a local press statement may be released on or after 10:30 am EDT June 16, drawing on the press guidance and the text of the TIP Report's country narrative provided in para 8.

18. Begin Final Text of Brazil,s country narrative in the 2009 TIP Report:

BRAZIL (TIER 2)

Brazil is a source country for men, women, girls, and boys trafficked within the country and transnationally for the purpose of commercial sexual exploitation, as well as a source country for men and boys trafficked internally for forced labor. The Brazilian Federal Police estimate that 250,000 to 400,000 children are exploited in domestic prostitution, in resort and tourist areas, along highways, and in Amazonian mining brothels. According to UNODC, sex trafficking of Brazilian women occurs in every Brazilian state and the federal district. A large number of Brazilian women and children, many from the state of Goias, are trafficked abroad for commercial sexual exploitation, typically to Spain, Italy, Portugal, and The Netherlands. Brazilian women and children also are trafficked for commercial sexual exploitation to neighboring countries such as Suriname, Guyana, French Guiana, Venezuela, and Paraguay. More than 25,000 Brazilian men are subjected to slave labor within the country, typically on cattle ranches, sugar-cane plantations, logging and mining camps, and large farms producing corn, cotton, soy, and charcoal for pig iron. Some boys have been identified as slave laborers in cattle ranching, mining, and the production of charcoal for pig iron. Slave labor victims are commonly lured with promises of good pay by local recruiters) known as gatos) in rural northeastern states to interior locations. A growing trend documented in an extensive NGO study released in early 2009 shows that approximately half of the more than 5,000 men freed from slave labor last year were found exploited on plantations growing sugar cane for the production of ethanol, electricity, and food. Moreover, slave laborers are increasingly being rescued from sugar-alcohol plantations, cattle ranches, and other sectors in states where agricultural borders are expanding into the Amazon forest and other new areas such as the Cerrado, the Atlantic Forest, and Pantanal. Domestic child servitude, particularly involving teenage girls, also was a problem in the country. To a lesser extent, Brazil is a destination for the trafficking of men, women, and children from Bolivia and Paraguay for forced labor in garment factories and textile sweatshops in metropolitan centers such as Sao Paulo. Child sex tourism remains a serious problem, particularly in resort and coastal areas in Brazil,s northeast. Child sex tourists typically arrive from Europe and, to a lesser extent, the United States. In a newer trend, some arranged fishing expeditions to the Amazon were organized for the purpose of child sex tourism for European and American exploiters.

The Government of Brazil does not fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking; however, it is making significant efforts to do so. Last year the government sustained strong efforts to rescue victims of slave labor through mobile inspection operations in the Amazon and other remote locations, and improved coordination of law enforcement efforts to prosecute and punish traffickers for forced labor and sex trafficking crimes. However, government-provided shelter services and protections for some trafficking victims, particularly adult males and undocumented foreign victims, remained inadequate. Brazilian officials recognize human trafficking as a serious

problem; the government's response has been strong but insufficient to eradicate the phenomenon, especially in light of the large number of victims present in the country, in addition to the many Brazilians trafficked overseas.

Recommendations for Brazil: Increase efforts to investigate and prosecute trafficking offenses, and convict and sentence trafficking offenders, including public officials alleged to facilitate trafficking activity; continue to improve coordination on criminal slave labor cases between labor officials and federal prosecutors to hold exploiters accountable; continue to improve victim assistance and protection, especially for victims of slave labor who are vulnerable to being re-trafficked; consider increasing penalties for fraudulent recruiting crimes to more effectively target and punish unscrupulous recruiters of forced labor; and improve data collection.

Prosecution

The Brazilian government improved law enforcement efforts to confront human trafficking crimes during the past year. Brazilian laws prohibit most forms of trafficking in persons.

Sections 231 and 231-A of the Brazilian penal code prohibit promoting or facilitating prostitution inside or outside of the country, prescribing penalties of three to eight years, imprisonment; sentences may be increased up to 12 years when violence, threats, or fraud are used. The above penalties are sufficiently stringent and commensurate with those prescribed for other serious crimes, such as rape. Labor trafficking is criminalized pursuant to Section 149 of the penal code, which prohibits *trabalho escravo* (slave labor) -- or reducing a person to a condition analogous to slavery -- including by means of debt bondage, prescribing a sufficiently stringent penalty of two to eight years, imprisonment. However, Brazilian law may not adequately criminalize other means of non-physical coercion or fraud used to subject workers to forced labor, such as threatening foreign migrants with deportation unless they continued to work. Articles 206 and 207 prohibit the fraudulent recruitment or enticement of workers, internally or internationally, prescribing penalties of one to three years, imprisonment. A 2006 presidential decree included a stated goal to amend Brazilian anti-trafficking laws to achieve parity between penalties applied to sex trafficking and forced labor crimes; such amendments remain unrealized.

Comprehensive nationwide data on anti-trafficking investigations, prosecutions, convictions, and sentences are difficult to obtain. However, partial-year statistics for 2008 reported by the Federal Police indicate authorities opened 55 international sex trafficking investigations, filed 21 indictments and arrested 50 suspects. An additional two investigations and indictments were filed for internal sex trafficking crimes. Transnational cases investigated last year include trafficking of Brazilian women to Italy, Spain, Portugal, and Switzerland, in addition to trafficking of Paraguayan women to Brazil. Since March 2008, 22 defendants were convicted on sex trafficking charges, with sentences ranging from 14 months, to more than 13 years, imprisonment. Such results represent an increase when compared to seven sex trafficking convictions and two sentences achieved in 2007.

The government improved efforts to prosecute forced labor crimes last year, opening 64 federal investigations under Article 149. In March 2009, a federal judge in Par state convicted and sentenced 22 defendants on slave labor charges, imposing sentences ranging from three to 10 years, imprisonment, in addition to fines. The court dismissed charges against 19 defendants, acquitted six defendants, and convicted an additional six defendants of lesser crimes. In a separate case in May 2008, a federal court in Maranhao sentenced a defendant to 11 years, imprisonment for reducing victims to slavery-like conditions; the defendant also was ordered to pay substantial amounts in owed wages to workers. These cases appear to be the first applications of a 2006 Supreme Court ruling, which required that all slave-labor

complaints be heard in federal courts only, instead of in both federal and state courts as was the case previously. The Ministry of Labor's anti-slave labor mobile units increased the number of rescue operations conducted last year; the unit's labor inspectors continued to free victims, and require those responsible to pay fines and restitution to victims. In the past, mobile unit inspectors did not typically seize physical evidence or attempt to interview witnesses with the goal of developing a criminal investigation or prosecution; labor inspectors and labor prosecutors only have civil jurisdiction, and their anti-trafficking efforts were not coordinated with public ministry prosecutors, who initiate criminal cases in federal court. Federal interagency coordination and information exchange on anti-trafficking cases remained weak last year; achieving effective coordination among differing federal, state, and municipal authorities was considered more challenging.

The Ministry of Labor's &dirty list,8 which publicly identifies individuals and corporate entities the government has determined to have been responsible for slave labor, continued to provide civil punishment to those engaged in this serious crime, with the amount of monetary fines increasing along with violators being denied access to publicly funded credit sources. During the year, however, a number of individuals and corporate entities were able to avoid opprobrium by suing to remove their names from the &dirty list8 or reincorporating under a different name. Although the government opened no formal investigations or prosecutions of trafficking-related complicity during the past year, credible NGO reporting indicated serious official involvement with such activity at the local level, alleging that police turned a blind eye to child prostitution and potential human trafficking activity in commercial sex sites. Past allegations have involved elected officials, as was the case with two aldermen from Par alleged to be involved with a child prostitution network. Other reporting indicates that state police officials were involved in the killing or intimidation of witnesses involved in testifying against police officials in labor exploitation or forced labor hearings. Killings and intimidation of rural labor activists and labor union organizers continued, some of whom were active in fighting forced labor practices; some of these killings reportedly occurred with the participation or knowledge of state law enforcement officials. In one incident in February 2008, farmers in Mato Grosso, supported by local military police, fired shots on an anti-slave labor mobile inspection team. A few Brazilian legislators have sought to interfere with the operation of the labor inspection teams in the past.

Protection

The Brazilian government sustained efforts to provide trafficking victims with services during the year. The Ministry of Social Development provided generalized shelter, counseling, and medical aid to adult and child victims of sex trafficking, along with other victims of sexual violence and exploitation. The government also provided some funding to NGOs to furnish additional victim services. The federal Ministry of Justice, with assistance from UNODC, funded victim assistance centers in conjunction with state governments in Sao Paulo, Rio de Janeiro, Goias, and Cearas. In 2008, an assistance center was opened in Belem, capital of Par state, to provide care and services to victims trafficked to and from Suriname. A national hotline for reporting incidents of child sexual abuse and exploitation, which includes reports of child sex trafficking and commercial sex exploitation, continued to register calls in 2008. Brazilian police continued to refer child sex trafficking victims to government-run shelters for care, though they did not utilize formal procedures to identify trafficking victims among other vulnerable populations, such as prostituted adult women in brothels. Labor inspectors and police officers who were members of the Ministry of Labor's anti-slave labor mobile units employed procedures to identify victims of forced labor. However, slave labor

victims, typically adult Brazilian men, were not eligible for government-provided shelter assistance, though unemployment benefits, job training, and travel assistance were available.

Short- or long-term government-provided shelter assistance was provided to women and children victims of trafficking, domestic violence, and other crimes, though some NGOs provided such aid to male victims. During the year, the Ministry of Labor's mobile units identified and freed 5,016 victims of slave labor through 154 operations targeting 290 properties. Such results compare with 5,963 victims of forced labor freed through 114 operations targeting 203 properties in 2007. In a continuing and growing trend documented by an extensive NGO study released in January 2009, approximately half of the victims freed in 2008 were found on plantations growing sugar cane for Brazil, expanding production and export of ethanol, a biofuel, in addition to production of sugar cane for food use and electricity. In just 19 operations, mobile labor units rescued 2,553 victims from forced labor on sugar plantations, where workers can be subjected to high daily production and cutting quotas. However, government officials and researchers also found that while sugar cane production involves large numbers of workers, slave labor on Brazilian cattle ranches involves a higher degree of human exploitation, particularly in land- and forest-clearing activities. Last year, mobile inspection teams freed 1,026 slave workers from cattle ranches in 85 operations, marking it as the sector with the second highest number of victims freed from slave labor in Brazil. The Ministry of Labor awarded all slave labor victims a total of \$3.6 million in compensation as a result of these 2008 operations, funds which were derived from fines levied against the landowners or employers identified during the operations. However, due to lack of effective prosecutions of recruiters of slave labor, some rescued victims have been re-trafficked, according to NGOs.

The government encouraged sex trafficking victims to participate in investigations and prosecutions of trafficking, though victims often were reluctant to testify due to fear of reprisals from traffickers and corrupt law enforcement officials. The government did not generally encourage victims of forced labor to participate in criminal investigations or prosecutions. Some victims of sex trafficking were offered short-term protection under a witness protection program, which was generally regarded as lacking resources. The government did not detain, fine, or otherwise penalize identified victims of trafficking for unlawful acts committed as a direct result of being trafficked. However, the government does not provide foreign trafficking victims with legal alternatives to removal to countries where they may face hardship or retribution. Law enforcement personnel noted that undocumented foreign victims were often deported before they could assist with prosecutions against their traffickers.

Prevention

The Brazilian government increased efforts to prevent human trafficking last year. A national plan of action on human trafficking, which was released in early 2008, continued to be implemented. In particular, the Ministry of Justice named the first six winners of an annual cash prize for best anti-trafficking essays written by college and graduate students. Federal authorities generally maintained good cooperation with international organizations and NGOs on anti-trafficking activities. The Ministry of Tourism continued its public radio and television campaign of "Quem ama, protege" (he who loves, protects) aimed at addressing child sexual exploitation in the tourism sector, and produced broadcast versions in several languages. The government took measures to reduce demand for commercial sex acts by conducting campaigns against the commercial sexual exploitation of minors along highways and during the 2009 Carnival holiday period. The Brazilian military uses the U.N. Peacekeeping Office's anti-trafficking and forced labor training modules to train its troops for deployment to international peacekeeping missions.

19. Post may wish to deliver the following points, which offer technical and legal background on the TIP Report process, to the host government as a non-paper with the above TIP Report country narrative:

(begin non-paper)

-- The U.S. Congress, through its passage of the 2000 Trafficking Victims Protection Act, as amended (TVPA), requires the Secretary of State to submit an annual Report to Congress. The goal of this Report is to stimulate action and create partnerships around the world in the fight against modern-day slavery. The USG approach to combating human trafficking follows the TVPA and the standards set forth in the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (commonly known as the "Palermo Protocol"). The TVPA and the Palermo Protocol recognize that this is a crime in which the victims, labor or services (including in the "sex industry") are obtained or maintained through force, fraud, or coercion, whether overt or through psychological manipulation. While much attention has focused on international flows, both the TVPA and the Palermo Protocol focus on the exploitation of the victim, and do not require a showing that the victim was moved.

-- Recent amendments to the TVPA removed the requirement that only countries with a "significant number" of trafficking victims be included in the Report. Beginning with the 2009 TIP Report, countries determined to be a country of origin, transit, or destination for victims of severe forms of trafficking are included in the Report and assigned to one of three tiers. Countries assessed as meeting the "minimum standards for the elimination of severe forms of trafficking" set forth in the TVPA are classified as Tier 1. Countries assessed as not fully complying with the minimum standards, but making significant efforts to meet those minimum standards are classified as Tier 2. Countries assessed as neither complying with the minimum standards nor making significant efforts to do so are classified as Tier 3.

-- The TVPA also requires the Secretary of State to provide a "Special Watch List" to Congress later in the year. Anti-trafficking efforts of the countries on this list are to be evaluated again in an Interim Assessment that the Secretary of State must provide to Congress by February 1 of each year. Countries are included on the "Special Watch List" if they move up in "tier" rankings in the annual TIP Report -- from 3 to 2 or from 2 to 1) or if they have been placed on the Tier 2 Watch List.

-- Tier 2 Watch List consists of Tier 2 countries determined: (1) not to have made "increasing efforts" to combat human trafficking over the past year; (2) to be making significant efforts based on commitments of anti-trafficking reforms over the next year, or (3) to have a very significant number of trafficking victims or a significantly increasing victim population. As indicated in reftel B, the TVPRA of 2008 contains a provision requiring that a country that has been included on Tier 2 Watch List for two consecutive years after the date of enactment of the TVPRA of 2008 be ranked as Tier 3. Thus, any automatic downgrade to Tier 3 pursuant to this provision would take place, at the earliest, in the 2011 TIP Report (i.e., a country would have to be ranked Tier 2 Watch List in the 2009 and 2010 Reports before being subject to Tier 3 in the 2011 Report). The new law allows for a waiver of this provision for up to two additional years upon a determination by the President that the country has developed and devoted sufficient resources to a written plan to make significant efforts to bring itself into compliance with the minimum standards.

-- Countries classified as Tier 3 may be subject to statutory restrictions for the subsequent fiscal year on non-humanitarian and non-trade-related foreign assistance and, in some circumstances, withholding of funding for

participation by government officials or employees in educational and cultural exchange programs. In addition, the President could instruct the U.S. executive directors to international financial institutions to oppose loans or other utilization of funds (other than for humanitarian, trade-related or certain types of development assistance) with respect to countries on Tier 3. Countries classified as Tier 3 that take strong action within 90 days of the Report's release to show significant efforts against trafficking in persons, and thereby warrant a reassessment of their Tier classification, would avoid such sanctions. Guidelines for such actions are in the DOS-crafted action plans to be shared by Posts with host governments.

-- The 2009 TIP Report, issuing as it does in the midst of the global financial crisis, highlights high levels of trafficking for forced labor in many parts of the world and systemic contributing factors to this phenomenon: fraudulent recruitment practices and excessive recruiting fees in workers, home countries; the lack of adequate labor protections in both sending and receiving countries; and the flawed design of some destination countries, "sponsorship systems" that do not give foreign workers adequate legal recourse when faced with conditions of forced labor. As the May 2009 ILO Global Report on Forced Labor concluded, forced labor victims suffer approximately \$20 billion in losses, and traffickers, profits are estimated at \$31 billion. The current global financial crisis threatens to increase the number of victims of forced labor and increase the associated "cost of coercion."⁸

-- The text of the TVPA and amendments can be found on website www.state.gov/g/tip.

-- On June 16, 2009, the Secretary of State will release the ninth annual TIP Report in a public event at the State Department. We are providing you an advance copy of your country's narrative in that report. Please keep this information embargoed until 10:00 am Washington DC time June 16. The State Department will also hold a general briefing for officials of foreign embassies in Washington DC on June 17 at 3:30 pm EDT.

(end non-paper)

¶10. Posts should make sure that the relevant country narrative is readily available on or through the Mission's web page in English and appropriate local language(s) as soon as possible after the TIP Report is released. Funding for translation costs will be handled as it was for the Human Rights Report. Posts needing financial assistance for translation costs should contact their regional bureau's EX office.

¶11. The following is press guidance provided for Post to use with local media.

Q1: Why was Brazil again given a ranking of Tier 2?

A: The Government of Brazil does not fully comply with the minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking; however, it is making significant efforts to do so. Last year the government sustained strong efforts to rescue victims of slave labor through mobile inspection operations in the Amazon and other remote locations, and improved coordination of law enforcement efforts to prosecute and punish traffickers for forced labor and sex trafficking crimes. However, government-provided shelter services and protections for some trafficking victims, particularly adult males and undocumented foreign victims, remained inadequate. Brazilian officials recognize human trafficking as a serious problem; the government's response has been strong but insufficient to eradicate the phenomenon, especially in light of the large number of victims present in the country, in addition to the many Brazilians trafficked overseas.

Q2: What is the nature of Brazil's trafficking problem?

A: Brazil is a source country for men, women, girls, and boys trafficked within the country and transnationally for the purpose of commercial sexual exploitation, as well as a source country for men and boys trafficked internally for forced labor. The Brazilian Federal Police estimate that 250,000 to 400,000 children are exploited in domestic prostitution, in resort and tourist areas, along highways, and in Amazonian mining brothels. According to UNODC, sex trafficking of Brazilian women occurs in every Brazilian state and the federal district. A large number of Brazilian women and children, many from the state of Goias, are trafficked abroad for commercial sexual exploitation, typically to Spain, Italy, Portugal, and The Netherlands. Brazilian women and children also are trafficked for commercial sexual exploitation to neighboring countries such as Suriname, Guyana, French Guiana, Venezuela, and Paraguay. More than 25,000 Brazilian men are subjected to slave labor within the country, typically on cattle ranches, sugar-cane plantations, logging and mining camps, and large farms producing corn, cotton, soy, and charcoal for pig iron. Some boys have been identified as slave laborers in cattle ranching, mining, and the production of charcoal for pig iron. Slave labor victims are commonly lured with promises of good pay by local recruiters) known as gatos) in rural northeastern states to interior locations. A growing trend documented in an extensive NGO study released in early 2009 shows that approximately half of the more than 5,000 men freed from slave labor last year were found exploited on plantations growing sugar cane for the production of ethanol, electricity, and food. Moreover, slave laborers are increasingly being rescued from sugar-alcohol plantations, cattle ranches, and other sectors in states where agricultural borders are expanding into the Amazon forest and other new areas such as the Cerrado, the Atlantic Forest, and Pantanal. Domestic child servitude, particularly involving teenage girls, also was a problem in the country. To a lesser extent, Brazil is a destination for the trafficking of men, women, and children from Bolivia and Paraguay for forced labor in garment factories and textile sweatshops in metropolitan centers such as Sao Paulo. Child sex tourism remains a serious problem, particularly in resort and coastal areas in Brazil,s northeast. Child sex tourists typically arrive from Europe and, to a lesser extent, the United States. In a newer trend, some arranged fishing expeditions to the Amazon were organized for the purpose of child sex tourism for European and American exploiters.

Q3: According to recent TIP Reports, forced labor seems to be a problem in Brazil. What, if anything, has Brazil done to respond to this concern?

A: During the year, the Ministry of Labor,s mobile units identified and freed 5,016 victims of forced labor through 154 operations targeting 290 properties. The Ministry of Labor awarded slave labor victims with compensation totaling \$3.6 million as a result of these 2008 operations, funds which were derived from fines levied against the landowners or employers identified during the operations. Victims also were provided with immediate medical care and counseling. However, the USG has concerns that some of these victims may be re-trafficked due to inadequate reintegration assistance and lack of economic opportunity. In addition, approximately half of the victims freed in 2008 were found on plantations growing sugar cane for Brazil,s expanding production and export of ethanol, a biofuel, in addition to production of sugar cane for food use and electricity. In just 19 operations, mobile labor units rescued 2,553 victims from forced labor on sugar plantations, where workers can be subjected to high daily production and cutting quotas. Last year the government improved efforts to prosecute forced labor crimes, opening 64 federal investigations under Brazilian law. In March 2009, a federal judge in Par state convicted and sentenced 22 defendants on slave labor charges, imposing sentences ranging from three to ten years, imprisonment, in addition to fines. In a separate case in May 2008, a federal court in Maranhao sentenced a defendant to 11 years, imprisonment for reducing victims to slavery-like conditions; the defendant also was ordered to

pay substantial amounts in owed wages to workers. These cases appear to be the first applications of a 2006 Supreme Court ruling, which required that all slave-labor complaints be heard in federal courts only, instead of in both federal and state courts as was the case previously. The Ministry of Labor's "dirty list" which publicly identifies individuals and corporate entities the government has determined to have been responsible for slave labor, continued to provide non-jail punishment to those engaged in this serious crime, largely through public shame and the barring of these entities, access to loans from state financial institutions.

A number of individuals and corporate entities, however, were able to remove their names from the "dirty list" through court action or reincorporating under a different name.

Q4: How can Brazil improve its anti-trafficking efforts?

A: To advance its efforts to combat human trafficking, the Government of Brazil could: increase efforts to investigate and prosecute trafficking offenses, and convict and sentence trafficking offenders, including public officials alleged to facilitate trafficking activity; continue to improve coordination on criminal slave labor cases between labor officials and federal prosecutors to hold exploiters accountable; continue to improve victim assistance and protection, especially for victims of slave labor who are vulnerable to being re-trafficked; consider increasing penalties for fraudulent recruiting crimes to more effectively target and punish unscrupulous recruiters of forced labor; and improve data collection.

¶12. The Department appreciates posts, assistance with the preceding action requests.

CLINTON